Research Trends Explored Over the Last Two Years in Inclusive Postsecondary Education

Heidi J. Graff, Ph.D., Stacie Brady, M.S., Linda H. Mason, Ph.D. George Mason University

> Beth Myers, Ed.D. Syracuse University

The Journal of Inclusive Postsecondary Education was created to fill the dearth of publication outlets for research in inclusive postsecondary education (IPSE). To better evaluate the types of articles published, and the journals publishing this work, a trend evaluation was conducted. Research syntheses, such as literature reviews and meta-analyses, are commonly employed to aggregate findings across studies of a similar intervention or target behavior. This allows researchers to evaluate the effectiveness of the interventions. Another type of analysis that can help researchers evaluate research within a specific field is the trend analysis. Rather than evaluating the efficacy of a specific educational practice, journal articles are reviewed to discover trends in research. Within a relatively new field such as IPSE, this type of review serves to explore articles published and to discover gaps in the quantity or quality of research.

Trend Analysis

In the field of learning disabilities (LD), Lessen, Dudzinski, Karsh, and Van Acker (1989) conducted a journal analysis of seven LD-specific research journals. Articles that were published in these journals between 1978 and 1987 were evaluated for trends. Results showed that less than 4% of articles were intervention research. Researchers were also able to identify under-researched and over-researched areas related to students with LD and then make recommendations about methodological information that should be reported when disseminating research findings for this population. Similarly, in 2009, Mastropieri and colleagues extended this work through a trend analysis of 11 professional journals that publish research related to high-incidence disabilities (LD, emotional disabilities, and developmental disabilities) over a 19-year period (1988 to 2006). Journals were targeted that had high circulation rates or were published by professional organizations such as the Council for Exceptional Children (CEC) or CEC Divisions. Findings showed that while more than half (58%) of articles published were research, only 15.9% were intervention research. Furthermore, in 2014, Graff, Berkeley, Evmenova, and Park extended this review to investigate research within popular autism journals. Findings uncovered that the primary research conducted was on medical models, followed by research on characteristics of social emotional behavior issues. Only a small amount of intervention research was conducted with school-age children. In regard to the field of IPSE, the findings in the current brief yield information that informs future research efforts and is of interest to researchers, policymakers, and practitioners.

Method

All feature articles published in selected journals over 2 years (2017 and 2018) were included in the analysis; this is the period in which JIPE was looking at viability in the publishing realm. Using Think College Research **Affinity** the Group (https://thinkcollege.net/technical-assistance/affinity-groups/research) forum and compiling a bibliography from meeting notes for both years, a base list of references was assembled. New searches were also initiated from the databases of Social Science Index and Psych Info under the following terms in isolation and combination: inclusive, postsecondary, intellectual disability, developmental disability, college, university, and autism. A coding instrument and coding conventions were developed and used during data collection. In all, 58 variables were coded. First basic information was identified: (a) coder name, (b) journal name, (c) year of publication, (d) volume number, (e) issue number, and (f) last name of the authors. Next, each article was classified as (a) a research study, (b) a literature review, (c) a position paper, or (d) a program evaluation/description. Introductions, commentaries

Research

If an article was classified as research, it was further coded as either qualitative, quantitative, single-subject design, secondary data analysis, or mixed methodology research. Qualitative research was further evaluated and coded as (a) an interview, (b) a case study, (c) a narrative, (d) other, or (e) a combination. Narrative research studies were personal stories told in the first person. Case studies investigated a single person, program, event, process, social group, or phenomenon related to IPSE. The "other design" category was used to capture studies that did not fit into one of these categories. Quantitative research was further evaluated and coded as (a) an assessment study, (b) a characteristics study, (c) an experimental/group study, or (d) a statistics study. Assessment studies focused on comparison among tools used specifically for assessing various abilities of individuals with intellectual or developmental disability (IDD). Characteristics studies examined the features of individuals with IDD-in most cases. compared to either other disability groups or to a typically-developing population. Statistical studies looked at secondary analyses of previous data sets. Single-subject research designs were further evaluated to determine if they were (a) AB, (b) ABA, (c) ABAB, (d) ABC, or (e) other (e.g., changing criterion, alternating condition). Specific data relating to the participants and focus of each intervention study were also coded.

Participants and Topics

Participants were classified as (a) parents, (b) teachers/paraprofessionals, (c) individuals with ASD, (d) individuals with IDD, (e) individuals with another disability, (f) professors, (g) families, (h) other individuals, (i) mentors, (j) people without disabilities, (k) people with different disabilities, or (l) a mixture of subjects with disabilities and without disabilities. Additionally, each research study was then sorted into an age category: (a) transition

students, (b) postsecondary, (c) graduates, (d) alumni-post-graduation, (e) middle adult, (f) lifespan (birth to death), or (g) other. The primary focus of all articles was also determined and coded in one of the following categories: (a) employment, (b) independent living, (c) residential housing, (d) behavioral/emotional health, (e) foundational academics, (f) college classes, (g) community integration, (h) life experiences, (i) special services/support, (j) combination, (k) mentors, (l) self-determination, (m) self-advocacy, or (n) Transition and Postsecondary Programs for Students with Intellectual Disability (TPSID).

Procedures

There were three primary coders, with one having a Ph.D. in special education, the second in doctoral-level studies, and the third completing a master's in applied behavior analysis. The first two authors developed the coding conventions based upon previous research (Graff, Berkeley, Evmenova, & Park, 2014; Mastropieri et al., 2009) and all authors were trained in coding conventions prior to coding. Journals were accessed through electronic databases and articles for each issue were coded using the coding instrument and conventions described previously. If there was a question about how to code an item, the first author documented the question and discussed it with the research team to obtain a consensus about how the item should be coded. Data were entered into the SPSS 19.0 software package for analysis. To establish reliability, 40% of articles were randomly selected and coded by a different researcher than had conducted the original coding. Reliability was established at 100%.

Results

Data were analyzed with SPSS. No emerging leader was found in the field of journals. There were 59 articles published in 46 journals, with the biggest contributor (five articles) being the *Career Development and Transition for Exceptional Individuals*. The *Journal of Intellectual Disabilities*, *Journal of Vocational Rehabilitation*, and *Remedial and Special Education* each published three articles. Other journals that had two articles included *America Journal of Occupational Therapy*, *Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities*, *Journal of Disability Policy Studies*, *Journal of Special Education Technology*, *Research and Practice for Persons with Severe Disabilities*, and *American Journal on Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities*. First authors Carter, Francis, Gilson, Grigal, and Shogren were noted to each have two articles published. Other prolific authors, with three or more articles, regardless of author order, included Bumble, Carter, Smith, and Papay.

There were 43 research studies, 2 literature reviews, 7 position papers, and 7 program evaluations. For research, the analysis showed 4 surveys, 13 qualitative studies, 14 quantitative studies, 4 single-subject designs, 5 secondary data analyses, and 3 mixed-methods studies. For qualitative studies, interviews were the largest, with 10 articles. Twenty statistics were published, with many exploring the National Longitudinal Transition Study-2 data. Thirty-two articles targeted the IDD population, with only 4 studies for autism, 4 for other disability, and 4 mixed, focusing on those individuals with and without disabilities. With the noted age of the subjects, 38 articles were with postsecondary

students and 12 were with the transition-aged population. The biggest topics of study were college classes (11 articles) and articles with a focus on employment (9 articles).

Conclusion and Implications

Based upon the results, there is an overwhelming need for a journal to publish research on inclusive postsecondary education. There are productive and creative researchers in the field who want to explore using both qualitative and qualitative methodologies to seek best practices for individuals with intellectual and developmental disabilities. Therefore, the *Journal of Inclusive Postsecondary Education* will serve to highlight research activities to uncover solutions, to better inform programs, and to be a site for dissemination of information and publication.

References

- Anderson, S., Griffith, R., & Crawford, L. (2017). TPACK in special education: Preservice teacher decision making while integrating iPads into instruction. *Contemporary Issues in Technology and Teacher Education, 17*(1), 97-127.
- Berg, L. A., Jirikowic, T., Haerling, K., & MacDonald, G. (2017). Navigating the hidden curriculum of higher education for postsecondary students with intellectual disabilities. *The American Journal of Occupational Therapy, 71*(3), 1-9. doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.5014/ajot.2017.024703
- Bias, K. & Docheff, D., (2017). Helping students THRIVE—A two-way street. *Strategies*, *30*(2), 22-26, doi:10.1080/08924562.2016.1273805
- Björnsdóttir, K. (2017). Belonging to higher education: Inclusive education for students with intellectual disabilities. *European Journal of Special Needs Education*, *32*(1), 125-136, doi:10.1080/08856257.2016.1254968
- Bouck, E. C., & Chamberlain, C. (2017). Postschool services and postschool outcomes for individuals with mild intellectual disability. *Career Development and Transition for Exceptional Individuals*, *40*(4), 215-224. doi:https://doi.org/10.1177/2165143416665802
- Bumble, J. L., Carter, E. W., Bethune, L. K., Day, T., & McMillan, E. D. (2018). Community conversations on inclusive higher education for students with intellectual disability. *Career Development and Transition for Exceptional Individuals*, 42(1), 29-42. https://doi.org/10.1177/2165143418781303
- Carter, E. W., Gustafson, J. R., Mackay, M. M., Martin, K. P., Parsley, M. V., Graves, J., ... Cayton, J. (2018). Motivations and expectations of peer mentors within inclusive higher education programs for students with intellectual disability. *Career Development and Transition for Exceptional Individuals*. https://doi.org/10.1177/2165143418779989
- Chan, W., Smith, L. E., Hong, J., Greenberg, J. S., Lounds Taylor, J., & Mailick, M. R. (2018). Factors associated with sustained community employment among adults with autism and co-occurring intellectual disability. *Autism*, *22*(7), 794-803. https://doi.org/10.1177/1362361317703760
- Cook, A. L. (2017). Employing a social justice framework to promote postsecondary transition for students with intellectual disability. *International Journal for*

- Educational and Vocational Guidance, 17(3), 311-328. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10775-016-9336-8
- Eismann, M. M., Weisshaar, R., Capretta, C., Cleary, D. S., Kirby, A. V., & Persch, A. C. (2017). Characteristics of students receiving occupational therapy services in transition and factors related to postsecondary success. *The American Journal of Occupational Therapy, 71.*
- Evmenova, A. S., Graff, H. J., Genaro Motti, V., Giwa-Lawal, K., & Zheng, H. (2018). Designing a wearable technology intervention to support young adults with intellectual and developmental disabilities in inclusive postsecondary academic environments. *Journal of Special Education Technology*, *34*(2), 92-105. doi:10.1177/0162643418795833.
- Francis, G. L., Gordon, S., Kliethermes, A. J., Regester, A., Baldini, D., & Grant, A. (2018). Developing and implementing a postsecondary education program for young adults with intellectual and developmental disabilities: Processes and procedure. *Teacher Educators' Journal*, *11*, 134-156.
- Francis, G. L., Stride, A., & Reed, S. (2018). Transition strategies and recommendations: perspectives of parents of young adults with disabilities. *British Journal of Special Education, 45*(3), 277-301. https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8578.12232
- Giangreco, M. F. (2017). Expanding opportunities for students with intellectual disabilities. *Educational Leadership*, *74*(7), 52-57.
- Gilson C. B., Bethune L. K., Carter E. W., & McMillan, E. D. (2017). Informing and equipping parents of people with intellectual and developmental disabilities. *Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities*, *55*(5), 347-360.
- Gilson, C. B., Carter, E. W., Bumble, J. L., & McMillan, E. D. (2018). Family perspectives on integrated employment for adults with intellectual and developmental disabilities. *Research and Practice for Persons with Severe Disabilities*, *43*(1), 20-37. https://doi.org/10.1177/1540796917751134
- Giust, A. M., & Valle-Riestra, D. M. (2017). Supporting mentors working with students with intellectual disabilities in higher education. *Journal of Intellectual Disabilities*, *21*(2), 144-157. https://doi.org/10.1177/1744629516651019
- Graff, H. J., Evmenova, A. S., Berkeley, S., & Park, K. (2014). Autism spectrum disorders retrospective: Research published in three prominent journals. *Exceptionality*, *22*, 158-172.
- Graff, H. J., Moyher, R. E., Bair, J., Foster, C., Gorden, M. E., & Clem, J. (2018). Relationships and sexuality: How is a young adult with an intellectual disability supposed to navigate? *Sexuality & Disability*, *36*(2), 175-183. doi:10.1007/s11195-017-9499-3
- Green, J. C., Cleary, D. S., & Cannela-Malone, H. I. (2017). A model for enhancing employment outcomes through post-secondary education. *Journal of Vocational Rehabilitation*, *46*(3), 287-291. doi:10.3233/JVR-170863
- Griffin, M. M., & Papey, C. K. (2017). Supporting students with intellectual and developmental disabilities to attend college. *Teaching Exceptional Children,* 49(6), 411-419. doi: https://doi.org/10.1177/0040059917711695
- Grigal, M., & Papay, C. (2018). The promise of postsecondary education for students with intellectual disability. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, *160*, 77-88. https://doi.org/10.1002/ace.20301

- Grigal, M., Papay, C., Smith, F., Hart, D., & Verbeck, R. (2018). Experiences that predict employment for students with intellectual and developmental disabilities in federally funded higher education programs. *Career Development and Transition for Exceptional Individuals, 42*(1), 17-28. https://doi.org/10.1177/2165143418813358
- Haney, M. R., & Fisher, K. (2017). Student attitudes and perceptions about postsecondary education for people with intellectual disabilities (practice brief). *Journal of Postsecondary Education and Disability, 30*(1), 97-104.
- Hendrickson, J. M., Woods-Groves, S., Rodgers, D. B. & Datchik, S. (2017).

 Perceptions of students with autism and their parents: The college experience. *Education and Treatment of Children 40*(4), 571-596. West Virginia University

 Press. Retrieved February 14, 2019, from Project MUSE database.
- Holzberg, D. G., Test, D. W., & Rusher, D. E. (2018). Self-advocacy instruction to teach high school seniors with mild disabilities to access accommodations in college. *Remedial and Special Education*. https://doi.org/10.1177/0741932517752059
- Hosp, J. L., Ford, J. W., Huddle, S. M., & Hensley, K. K. (2018). The importance of replication in measurement research: Using curriculum-based measures with postsecondary students with developmental disabilities. *Assessment for Effective Intervention*, *43*(2), 96-109.
- Kelley, K. R. & Buchanan, S. K. (2017). College to career ready: Innovative practices that lead to integrated employment. *Journal of Vocational Rehabilitation* 46, 327-332. doi: 10.3233/JVR-170869
- Kubiak, J. (2017). Using "Voice" to understand what college students with intellectual disabilities say about the teaching and learning process. *Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs*, 17(1), 41-48. https://doi.org/10.1111/1471-3802.12098
- Lawler, J., Joseph, A., & Greene, M. (2018). Diversity in information systems: Increasing opportunities in STEM for capable students with developmental and intellectual disabilities. *Information Systems Education Journal*, 16(4), 13-26.
- Lessen, E., Dudzinski, M., Karsh, K., & Van Acker, R. (1989). A survey of ten years of academic intervention research with learning disabled students: Implications for research and practice. Learning Disabilities Focus, 4, 106-122.
- Lifshitz, H., Verkuilen, J., Shnitzer-Meirovich, S., & Altman, C. (2018). Crystallized and fluid intelligence of university students with intellectual disability who are fully integrated versus those who studied in adapted enrichment courses. *Plos ONE,* 13(3), 1-23. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0193351
- Lipscomb, S., Haimson, J., Liu, A. Y., Burghardt, J., Johnson, D. R., & Thurlow, M. (2017). *Preparing for life after high school: The characteristics and experiences of youth in special education. findings from the national longitudinal transition study 2012. volume 2: Comparisons across disability groups.* Mathematica Policy Research. Retrieved from Policy File Index Retrieved from https://search.proquest.com/docview/2099325611?accountid=14541
- Lombardi, A. R., Dougherty, S. M., & Monahan, J. (2018). Students with intellectual disabilities and career and technical education opportunities: A systematic literature review. *Journal of Disability Policy Studies*, *29*(2), 82-96. https://doi.org/10.1177/1044207318764863
- Love, K., & Mock, M. (2018). Participatory action research and student perspectives in a

- rural postsecondary education program. *Rural Special Education Quarterly*, 38(1), 43-52. https://doi.org/10.1177/8756870518783707
- Manikas, A., Carter, E. W., and Bumble, J. (2018) Inclusive community service among college students with and without intellectual disability: A pilot study. *Journal of Postsecondary Education and Disability*, *31*(3), 225-238.
- Matthews, N. L., Malligo, A., & Smith, C. J., (2017). Toward the identification of adaptive functioning intervention targets for intellectually-able, transition-ages youth with autism: An examination of caregiver responses on the Vineland-11. *Autism Research*, 10(2), 2023-2036. doi:https://doi.org/10.1002/aur.1855
- Moni, K., Jobling, A., & Baffour, B. (2018). Literacy learning outcomes in a longitudinal study of a postschool literacy education program for young adults with intellectual disabilities. *Journal of Policy and Practice in Intellectual Disabilities*, *15*(2), 155-165.
- Nye-Lengerman, K. (2017). Vocational rehabilitation service usage and outcomes for individuals with autism spectrum disorder. *Research in Autism Spectrum Disorders*, 41-42, 39-50. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rasd.2017.08.003
- Palmer, A. N., Elliott, W., & Cheatham, G. A. (2017) Effects of extracurricular activities on postsecondary completion for students with disabilities, *The Journal of Educational Research*. *110*(2), 151-158. doi:10.1080/00220671.2015.1058221
- Price, R., Marsh, A., & Fisher, M. (2018). Teaching young adults with intellectual and developmental disabilities community-based navigation skills to take public transportation. *Behavior Analysis in Practice*, *11*, 46-50. https://doi.org/10.1007/s40617-017-0202-z
- Prince, A. M., Plotner, A. J., & Bridges, W. C. (2018). Postschool engagement predictors for youth with intellectual disability: Results from South Carolina. *Exceptionality*, 1-15. doi:10.1080/09362835.2018.1480946
- Prohn, S. M., Kelley, Kelly, R., & Westling, D. L. (2018). Students with intellectual disability going to college: What are the outcomes? A pilot study. *Journal of Vocational Rehabilitation*, 48, 127-132.
- Qian, X., Johnson, D. R., Smith, F. A., & Papay, C. K. (2018). Predictors associated with paid employment status of community and technical college students with intellectual disability. *American Journal on Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities*, *123*, 329-343.
- Rakap, S., Cig, O., & Parlak-Rakap, A. (2017). Preparing preschool teacher candidates for inclusion: Impact of two special education courses on their perspectives. *Journal of Research in Special Educational Needs*, *17*(2), 98-109. https://doi.org/10.1111/1471-3802.12116
- Remis, K., Moore, C., Pichardo, J., Rosario, Z., & Moore, J. (2017). Teaching note—description and preliminary evaluation of a modified college experience for adults with intellectual and developmental disabilities. *Journal of Social Work Education*, *53*(2), 354-360. https://doi.org/10.1080/10437797.2016.1260504
- Rickson, D., & Warren, P. (2018). Music for all: Including young people with intellectual disability in a university environment. *Journal of Intellectual Disabilities, 22*(3), 279-293.
- Rillotta, F., Arthur, J., Hutchinson, C., & Raghavendra, P. (2018) Inclusive university experience in Australia: Perspectives of students with intellectual disability and their mentors. *Journal of Intellectual Disabilities*. doi:10.1177/1744629518769421

- Salmon, N., García Iriarte, E., & Burns, E. (2017). Research active programme: A pilot inclusive research curriculum in higher education. *International Journal of Research & Method in Education*, 40(2), 181-200. https://doi.org/10.1080/1743727X.2015.1099154
- Sannicandro, T., Parish, S. L., Fournier, S., Mitra, M., & Paiewonsky, M. (2018). Employment, income, and SSI effects of postsecondary education for people with intellectual disability. *American Journal on Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities*, *123*(5), 412-425.
- Schwantes, M., & Rivera, E. (2017). A team working together to make a big, nice, sound: An action research pilot study in an inclusive college setting. *The Arts in Psychotherapy*, *55*, 1-10. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aip.2017.01.011
- Scott, L., Thoma, C., Puglia, L., Temple, P., & D'Aguilar, A. (2017). Implementing a UDL framework: A study of current personnel preparation practices. *Intellectual and Developmental Disabilities*, *55*(1), 25-36. https://doi.org/10.1352/1934-9556-55.1.25
- Sheppard-Jones, K., Kleinert, H., Butler, L., & Whaley, B. (2018). Life outcomes and higher education: The need for longitudinal research using a broad range of quality of life indicators. *Intellectual and developmental disabilities*, *56*(1), 69-74.
- Shogren, K., & Shaw, L. (2017). The impact of personal factors on self-determination and early adulthood outcome constructs in youth with disabilities. *Journal of Disability Policy Studies*, *27*(4), 223-233. https://doi.org/10.1177/1044207316667732
- Shogren, K. A., Wehmeyer, M. L., Shaw, L. A., Grigal, M., Hart, D., Smith, F. A., & Khamsi, S. (2018). Predictors of self-determination in postsecondary education for students with intellectual and developmental disabilities. *Education and Training in Autism and Developmental Disabilities*, *53*(2), 146-159. Retrieved from https://search-proquest-com.mutex.gmu.edu/docview/2042207350?accountid=14541
- Smith, C., Cihak, D., Kim, B., McMahon, D., & Wright, R. (2017). Examining augmented reality to improve navigation skills in postsecondary students with intellectual disability. *Journal of Special Education Technology*, *32*(1), 3-11. https://doi.org/10.1177/0162643416681159
- Southward, J., & Kyzar, K. (2017). Predictors of competitive employment for students with intellectual and/or developmental disabilities. *Education and Training in Autism and Developmental Disabilities*, *52*(1), 26-37.
- Taylor, K. L. H., Skinner, C. H., Cazzell, S. S., Gibbons, S. D., Ryan, K., Ruddy, J. L., ... Cihak, D. (2018). Disfluent font can hinder sight-word acquisition in students with intellectual disability. *Remedial and Special Education*. https://doi.org/10.1177/0741932518771749
- Wehman, P., Taylor, J., Brooke, V., Avellone, L., Whittenburg, H., Ham, W., ... Carr, S. (2018). Toward competitive employment for persons with intellectual and developmental disabilities: What progress have we made and where do we need to go. *Research and Practice for Persons with Severe Disabilities*, *43*(3), 131-144. https://doi.org/10.1177/1540796918777730
- Wilczenski, F., Cook, A., & Regal, C. (2017). Rethinking college: Roles for school psychologists in transition planning for students with intellectual disability. *Contemporary School Psychology*, *21*(1), 71-79.

https://doi.org/10.1007/s40688-016-0112-z

Yuan, S. J., Ryan, S. M., & Dague, E. B. (2018). From the parents' perspective: The think college experience in rural Vermont. *Rural Special Education Quarterly*, *37*(2), 113-121.

doi:http://dx.doi.org.ezproxy.lib.umb.edu/10.1177/8756870518761878