



RE-ENVISIONING THE ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ASSIGNMENT

2017 INNOVATIONS in Teaching and Learning Conference
George Mason University

Marilyn K. Sharif
September 22, 2017



Re-envisioning the Annotated Bibliography Assignment

- Introduction to the Literature Matrix
 - Description
 - Goals
- Literature Matrix Assignment
 - Learning Outcomes
 - Instruction Steps
 - Assessment Rubric
- Advantages of the Literature Matrix
- Student Examples of Literature Matrix
- Conclusion/Q&A

What is a Literature Matrix?

- Table (or Excel spreadsheet)
- Research Tool
 - Organization
 - Reflection
 - Evaluation
 - Integration

MAIN QUESTION (Problem or Issue to be Solved):								

Sub-question #1								

Sub-question #2								

Sub-question #3								

THEY SAY*								I SAY*
SOURCE Author(s) and (Publication Date)	MAIN POINT (Claim)	HYPOTHESES THEORIES ASSUMPTIONS	METHODS	DATA Sub-question #1	DATA Sub-question #2	DATA Sub-question #3	CONCLUSIONS	COMMENTS (Analysis)
Source #1								
Source #2								
Source #3								

Literature Matrix Assignment

1. Add 3 relevant sources add to matrix
2. Develop corresponding list of references
3. Participate in a matrix peer-review workshop
4. Revise/expand matrix and reference list to 15 for instructor's mid-term evaluation
5. Revise/expand matrix and reference list to scaffold the literature review
6. Submit final matrix and reference list with 25 sources one week prior to the final paper



Learning Outcomes of the Literature Matrix Assignment

- Fill out the matrix with relevant source information
- Use the matrix for reflection and evaluation of sources
- Identify gaps in the literature and make any necessary revision of questions
- Integrate information from the matrix to write a literature review



Steps for Completing the Literature Matrix

Step 1 Questions & Sub- questions

Write **main research question** at the top of matrix...

and underneath, write any **subquestions**;

Prepare separate **list of references...**

using **one citation format** – e.g. APA, MLA or Chicago;

Step 2 Academic Sources

Using one row per source, enter **author(s) last name(s), and publication year** in first column...

and **main point, hypotheses, theories and assumptions** in next columns;

In the fourth column, **enter methods used by author(s)** of the source.

Step 3 Data & Con- clusions

Use **data columns** for brief notes and page #s of data supporting or refuting each sub-question...

dedicating one data column per question or sub-question;

In column eight, summarize **author(s)' main conclusion** of this source.

Step 4 Comments & Analysis

Briefly **state your analysis of this source...**do not write conclusion of the author(s).

Repeat this process for each source, one per row.

The Literature Matrix Worksheet

MAIN QUESTION (Problem or Issue to be Solved):

Sub-question #1

Sub-question #2

Sub-question #3

THEY SAY*								I SAY*
SOURCE Author(s) and (Publication Date)	MAIN POINT (Claim)	HYPOTHESES THEORIES ASSUMPTIONS	METHODS	DATA Sub-question #1	DATA Sub-question #2	DATA Sub-question #3	CONCLUSIONS	COMMENTS (Analysis)
Source #1								
Source #2								
Source #3								
Source #4								

*For templates to scaffold academic writing see: G. Graff & C. Birkenstein (2014). *They say, I say: The moves that matter in academic writing* (3rd ed.). NY: W.W. Norton & Company.



Assessment Rubric for the Literature Matrix Assignment

Literature Matrix Rubric

	5-4 Pts. @ Cell	3-2 Pts @ Cell	1-0 Pts @ Cell	Score
Questions/Subquestions	Question or problem to be solved at the top of the matrix is interdisciplinary and clearly stated; Subquestions are clearly related to main question and specific disciplines relevant to this inquiry.	Question or problem to be solved at the top of the matrix is potentially interdisciplinary and somewhat clearly stated; Subquestions are seemingly related to main question and specific disciplines relevant to this inquiry.	Question or problem to be solved at the top of the matrix does not appear to be interdisciplinary and/or not clearly stated; Subquestions are not clearly related to main question and specific disciplines relevant to this inquiry.	5
Sources*	All sources are current, peer-reviewed, contain the author's name(s), year of publication, and correspond to the list of references.	Most sources are current, peer-reviewed, contain the author's name(s), year of publication, and correspond to the list of references.	A few sources are current, peer-reviewed, contain the author's name(s), year of publication, and correspond to the list of references.	5
"They Say" Content	All sources provide content for main point, hypotheses, theories and/or assumptions, methods, data, author's conclusions, and appropriate page numbers.	Most sources provide content for main point, hypotheses, theories and/or assumptions, methods, data, author's conclusions, and appropriate page numbers.	A few sources provide content for main point, hypotheses, theories and/or assumptions, methods, data, author's conclusions, and appropriate page numbers.	5
"I Say" Content	Student's comments clearly indicate reflection on and analysis of all sources.	Student's comments indicate some reflection on and analysis of the sources.	Student's comments indicate little reflection and/or analysis of the sources.	5
References	Includes 15 or more peer-reviewed academic references by mid-term review and 25 such references by semester deadline.	Includes some peer-reviewed academic references by mid-term review and 25 such references by semester deadline.	Includes some peer-reviewed academic references by mid-term review and less than 25 such references by semester deadline.	5
Total Score				25 Pts.*

*Extra credit – a potential of up to 2 extra points will be added to your final score if you use correct citation style for author and publication date that corresponds to the list of references in your final proposal.

Advantages of the Literature Matrix

- **How does the literature matrix scaffold the learning process?**
 - Focuses the literature search
 - Aids research reading and summarization skills
 - Develops citation format skills
 - Helps avoid plagiarism
 - Develops reflective thinking and analytical skills
- **How does the literature matrix address the challenges of integration and critical analysis?**
 - Encourages comparing and contrasting information and sources
 - Required reflections help categorize and evaluate information and sources
 - Sources can be grouped for integration and discussion in the literature review



SAMPLE STUDENT MATRICES*

Example #1 Anonymous Student

Example #2 Heather Jones

Example #3 Anita Williams

*With permission.

References

- Booth, W., Colomb, G. & Williams, J. M. (2008). *The craft of research* (3rd ed.). Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.
- Graff, G. & Birkenstein, C. (2014). *They say, I say: The moves that matter in academic writing* (3rd ed.). New York, NY: W.W. Norton & Company.
- Rosen, L. J. (2012). *The academic writer's handbook* (3rd ed.). Boston, MA: Longman/Pearson.



Q & A

Contact information: msharif@gmu.edu