RE-ENVISIONING THE ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ASSIGNMENT

2017 INNOVATIONS in Teaching and Learning Conference
George Mason University

Marilyn K. Sharif
September 22, 2017
Re-envisioning the Annotated Bibliography Assignment

- Introduction to the Literature Matrix
  - Description
  - Goals
- Literature Matrix Assignment
  - Learning Outcomes
  - Instruction Steps
  - Assessment Rubric
- Advantages of the Literature Matrix
- Student Examples of Literature Matrix
- Conclusion/Q&A
What is a Literature Matrix?

- Table (or Excel spreadsheet)
- Research Tool
  - Organization
  - Reflection
  - Evaluation
  - Integration

### MAIN QUESTION
(Problem or Issue to be Solved):
_____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________

**SUB-QUESTION #1**
_____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________

**SUB-QUESTION #2**
_____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________

**SUB-QUESTION #3**
_____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>THEY SAY*</th>
<th>I SAY*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOURCE Author(s) and (Publication Date)</th>
<th>MAIN POINT (Claim)</th>
<th>HYPOTHESES THEORIES ASSUMPTIONS</th>
<th>METHODS</th>
<th>DATA Sub-question #1</th>
<th>DATA Sub-question #2</th>
<th>DATA Sub-question #3</th>
<th>CONCLUSIONS</th>
<th>COMMENTS (Analysis)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Source #1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source #2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source #3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Literature Matrix Assignment

1. Add 3 relevant sources add to matrix
2. Develop corresponding list of references
3. Participate in a matrix peer-review workshop
4. Revise/expand matrix and reference list to 15 for instructor’s mid-term evaluation
5. Revise/expand matrix and reference list to scaffold the literature review
6. Submit final matrix and reference list with 25 sources one week prior to the final paper
Learning Outcomes of the Literature Matrix Assignment

- Fill out the matrix with relevant source information
- Use the matrix for reflection and evaluation of sources
- Identify gaps in the literature and make any necessary revision of questions
- Integrate information from the matrix to write a literature review
Steps for Completing the Literature Matrix

**Step 1: Questions & Sub-questions**
Write main research question at the top of matrix...
and underneath, write any subquestions:

Prepare separate list of references...

using one citation format – e.g. APA, MLA or Chicago;

**Step 2: Academic Sources**
Using one row per source, enter author(s) last name(s), and publication year in first column...
and main point, hypotheses, theories and assumptions in next columns;

In the fourth column, enter methods used by author(s) of the source.

**Step 3: Data & Conclusions**
Use data columns for brief notes and page #s of data supporting or refuting each sub-question...
dedicating one data column per question or sub-question;

In column eight, summarize author(s)’ main conclusion of this source.

**Step 4: Comments & Analysis**
Briefly state your analysis of this source... do not write conclusion of the author(s).

Repeat this process for each source, one per row.
The Literature Matrix Worksheet

MAIN QUESTION (Problem or Issue to be Solved):

_____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________

Sub-question #1

_____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________

Sub-question #2

_____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________

Sub-question #3

_____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOURCE Author(s) and (Publication Date)</th>
<th>MAIN POINT (Claim)</th>
<th>HYPOTHESES THEORIES ASSUMPTIONS</th>
<th>METHODS</th>
<th>DATA Sub-question #1</th>
<th>DATA Sub-question #2</th>
<th>DATA Sub-question #3</th>
<th>CONCLUSIONS</th>
<th>COMMENTS (Analysis)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Source #1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source #2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source #3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source #4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

# Assessment Rubric for the Literature Matrix Assignment

## Literature Matrix Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions/Subquestions</th>
<th>5-4 Pts. @ Cell</th>
<th>3-2 Pts. @ Cell</th>
<th>1-0 Pts. @ Cell</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Question or problem to be solved at the top of the matrix is interdisciplinary and clearly stated; Subquestions are clearly related to main question and specific disciplines relevant to this inquiry.</td>
<td>Question or problem to be solved at the top of the matrix is potentially interdisciplinary and somewhat clearly stated; Subquestions are seemingly related to main question and specific disciplines relevant to this inquiry.</td>
<td>Question or problem to be solved at the top of the matrix does not appear to be interdisciplinary and/or not clearly stated; Subquestions are not clearly related to main question and specific disciplines relevant to this inquiry.</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Sources* | All sources are current, peer-reviewed, contain the author’s name(s), year of publication, and correspond to the list of references. | Most sources are current, peer-reviewed, contain the author’s name(s), year of publication, and correspond to the list of references. | A few sources are current, peer-reviewed, contain the author’s name(s), year of publication, and correspond to the list of references. | 5 |

| “They Say” Content | All sources provide content for main point, hypotheses, theories and/or assumptions, methods, data, author’s conclusions, and appropriate page numbers. | Most sources provide content for main point, hypotheses, theories and/or assumptions, methods, data, author’s conclusions, and appropriate page numbers. | A few sources provide content for main point, hypotheses, theories and/or assumptions, methods, data, author’s conclusions, and appropriate page numbers. | 5 |

| “I Say” Content | Student’s comments clearly indicate reflection on and analysis of all sources. | Student’s comments indicate some reflection on and analysis of the sources. | Student’s comments indicate little reflection and/or analysis of the sources. | 5 |

| References | Includes 15 or more peer-reviewed academic references by mid-term review and 25 such references by semester deadline. | Includes some peer-reviewed academic references by mid-term review and 25 such references by semester deadline. | Includes some peer-reviewed academic references by mid-term review and less than 25 such references by semester deadline. | 5 |

| Total Score | | | | 25 Pts.* |

*Extra credit – a potential of up to 2 extra points will be added to your final score if you use correct citation style for author and publication date that corresponds to the list of references in your final proposal.
Advantages of the Literature Matrix

- **How does the literature matrix scaffold the learning process?**
  - Focuses the literature search
  - Aids research reading and summarization skills
  - Develops citation format skills
  - Helps avoid plagiarism
  - Develops reflective thinking and analytical skills

- **How does the literature matrix address the challenges of integration and critical analysis?**
  - Encourages comparing and contrasting information and sources
  - Required reflections help categorize and evaluate information and sources
  - Sources can be grouped for integration and discussion in the literature review
SAMPLE STUDENT MATRICES*

Example #1  Anonymous Student
Example #2  Heather Jones
Example #3  Anita Williams

*With permission.


Q & A

Contact information:  msharif@gmu.edu